

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

Minutes of a meeting of the Planning Committee held on
Wednesday, 6 June 2018 at 10.30 a.m.

PRESENT: Councillor John Batchelor – Chairman

Councillors:	Dr. Martin Cahn	Peter Fane
	Bill Handley	Brian Milnes
	Judith Rippeth	Deborah Roberts
	Nick Wright	Anna Bradnam (substitute)
	Sue Ellington (substitute)	Heather Williams (substitute)

Officers in attendance for all or part of the meeting:

Alistair Funge (Planning Enforcement Officer), Jane Green (Head of New Communities / Interim Head of Development Control), John Koch (Planning Team Leader (West)), Karen Pell-Coggins (Principal Planning Officer), Stephen Reid (Senior Planning Lawyer), Ian Senior (Democratic Services Officer), Alison Twyford (Senior Planning Officer), Luke Waddington (Planning Officer) and Rebecca Whitney (Senior Planning Officer)

Councillors Dr. Tumi Hawkins and Aidan Van de Weyer were in attendance, by invitation.

1 (a) Apologies

Councillors Grenville Chamberlain, Pippa Heylings and Peter Topping sent Apologies for Absence. Their substitutes were Councillors Heather Williams, Anna Bradnam and Sue Ellington respectively.

In the absence of Councillor Heylings, the Chairman, with Committee affirmation, appointed Councillor Anna Bradnam as Vice Chairman for the meeting.

1 (b) Acknowledgement of previous Committee

Councillor Nick Wright recognised the contribution made by those serving both as ordinary and substitute members of Planning Committee during 2017-18, especially in the context of the challenges posed by the Council's inability to demonstrate a five-year housing land supply.

The Committee noted Councillor Wright's comment.

2 (a) Declarations of Interest

Councillor John Batchelor declared a Non-disclosable Pecuniary Interest in Minute 6 (S/0793/18/FL - Linton (1 Horseheath Road)). Councillor Batchelor's son, Councillor Henry Batchelor, has a business relationship with the applicant. Councillor John Batchelor had never met said applicant. In view of the legal advice he had received, Councillor John Batchelor would withdraw from the Chamber, take no part in the debate, and would not vote.

Councillor Peter Fane declared a non-pecuniary interest in Minute 8 (S/1041/18/FL - Great Shelford (22 Cambridge Road)). Although no longer a Great Shelford Parish Councillor, Councillor Fane had attended a Parish Council meeting in that capacity and taken part in the discussion there. He was considering the matter afresh.

2 (b) Recorded voting

Councillor John Batchelor proposed that all substantive votes be recorded. Councillor Nick Wright seconded the proposal.

Councillor Deborah Roberts supported the proposal, but reminded Members that the Planning Committee was non-political and that any political pressure must be resisted.

Upon a show of hands, the Committee **agreed unanimously** that, with immediate effect, all substantive votes at Planning Committee should be recorded by name and / or number and name.

3. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

The Committee authorised the Chairman to sign, as a correct record, the Minutes of the meeting held on 24 April 2018.

4. FIVE-YEAR HOUSING LAND SUPPLY - UPDATE

The Committee considered a report updating the position in respect of five-year housing land supply. The report stated that, subject to the five applications referred to therein, South Cambridgeshire District Council was now able to demonstrate that it had 5.0 years supply.

The Committee

1. **noted** the Five Year Housing Land Supply Update, published on 21 May 2018 (link contained at Appendix 1 to the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development), as a material planning consideration in determining planning applications and in planning appeals;
2. noted that no change be made to the previous decisions of Planning Committee in respect of the planning applications listed below to grant planning permission subject to the completion of a Legal Agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, which remain appropriate in light of this material change in circumstances for the reasons set out in paragraph 12-17 of the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development , subject to recommendation (3); namely:
 - S/0746/15/OL: Lion Works, Station Road West, Whittlesford Bridge [60 dwellings];
 - S/3064/16/OL: south of 279 St Neots Road, Hardwick [153 dwellings];
 - S/1032/17/FL: rear of 46-56 The Moor, Melbourn [23 dwellings]; and
 - S/1524/16/OL: land west of Casa De Foseta, St Neots Road, Hardwick [6 Dwellings]
3. **Noted** that no change be made to the previous decision of Planning Committee in respect of Planning Reference S/3052/16/FL (land at Meldreth Road, Shepreth [25 dwellings]) to grant planning permission subject to completion of a Legal Agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, which remains appropriate in light of this material change in circumstances for the reasons set out in paragraph 12-25 of the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development, and, in addition, agreed **unanimously**

to delete the requirement for a contribution towards the village mobile library service, to ensure that Community Infrastructure pooling restrictions are complied with.

5. **S/3787/17/FL - BARRINGTON (7 BACK LANE)**

Members visited the site on 4 June 2018.

The Team Leader (West) updated the Committee on the question of the ridge heights of the proposed dwellings and, in anticipation of approval, said that Condition (i) would be amended so as to refer to obscured glass rather than obscured glazing.

Anne Day (objector), James Snell (applicant's agent), Councillor Richard Gibson (Barrington Parish Council) and Councillor Aidan Van de Weyer (local Member) addressed the meeting. As a result of questions of clarification asked of the public speakers, Members established that

- The Green Charity's permission was needed in order to widen the road and it took the view that such road widening was physically impossible. The Charity did not have the resources to defend such a view in the courts.
- The agent considered the design of the proposed houses, and the materials to be used, to be reasonable as both were consistent with house designs elsewhere in Barrington
- The agent considered there to be no adverse impact on neighbours
- The agent denied that the proposed houses were of three storeys: roof space was being used to accommodate extra living space.
- The agent said that the Green would be reinstated to a higher standard than it was in before. Use during construction of the proposed buildings would be governed by a Construction Traffic Management Plan.
- Local concern focussed on the size and scale of the proposed buildings.

During the ensuing debate, Members expressed concern about the size and bulk of the proposed buildings, impact on the access track, and the question as to whether the proposal would either preserve or enhance the Conservation Area.

By ten votes to nil with Councillor John Batchelor abstaining, the Committee **refused** the application contrary to the recommendation in the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development. Those Members voting agreed the reason for refusal as by reason of their size, scale and siting, the two proposed two-storey dwellings would neither preserve nor enhance the character and appearance of the conservation area and the setting of surrounding listed buildings. The new dwellings would be visible and their presence harmful in views across the historic and attractive Barrington Green and between a number of listed buildings, the gaps between which formed an integral part of their setting and overall contribution to the conservation area.

6. **S/0793/18/FL - LINTON (1 HORSEHEATH ROAD)**

Members visited the site on 4 June 2018.

The case officer reported that the applicant had submitted an additional plan in support of the application.

Kate Kell (objector), Cath Slater (applicant's agent), and Councillor Enid Bald (Linton Parish Council) addressed the Committee).

Members raised concerns about neighbour amenity, sustainable drainage and tree protection. The case officer referred them to the relevant sections of the report saying that those concerns had been addressed satisfactorily.

The Senior Planning Lawyer prompted a short discussion relating to Permitted Development Rights and the need to protect the Council's interest as Local Planning Authority.

By ten votes to nil (Councillor John Batchelor having withdrawn from the Chamber) the Committee **approved** the application, subject to the Conditions and Informatives set out in the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development, and to the following: by seven votes to three, Members agreed to remove Permitted Development Rights, and gave officers delegated authority to finalise appropriate wording. Councillor Deborah Roberts' proposal to remove PDRs was seconded by Councillor Heather Williams. Councillors Bradnam, Cahn, Handley, Milnes, Rippeth, Roberts and Williams supported the proposal and Councillors Ellington, Fane and Wright opposed it.

7. S/4095/17/OL - ORWELL (MEADOWCROFT WAY)

Members visited the site on 4 June 2018.

Councillor Aidan Van de Weyer (local Member) told the Committee that he supported the application.

It was reported that South Cambridgeshire District Council currently had in excess of 800 names of people from all over the country on its Right to Build Register.

By ten votes to nil, the Committee **approved** the application subject to the Conditions and Informatives set out in the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development. Councillor Nick Wright did not vote because his son's name appeared on the Register maintained as part of the Right to Build Vanguard.

8. S/1041/18/FL - GREAT SHELFORD (22 CAMBRIDGE ROAD)

Members visited the site on 4 June 2018.

The Committee unanimously **approved** the application subject to the conditions set out in the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development, and an additional Condition restricting permitted working hours on the development of the site to between 8.00am and 6pm Monday to Friday and between 8.00am and 1.00pm Saturday. Working on Sundays and Bank Holidays would be prohibited.

9. S/1442/18/FL - FOXTON (40 ILLINGWORTH WAY)

Members visited the site on 4 June 2018.

Councillor Deborah Roberts (local Member) said that she did not object to the application.

The Committee unanimously **approved** the application subject to the Conditions set out in the report from the Joint Director for Planning and Economic Development.

10. ENFORCEMENT REPORT

The Committee **received and noted** an Update on enforcement action.

11. APPEALS AGAINST PLANNING DECISIONS AND ENFORCEMENT ACTION

The Committee considered a report on Appeals against planning decisions and enforcement action.

The Meeting ended at 1.05 p.m.
