

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Planning Committee 12 February 2020
AUTHOR/S: Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development

Application Number: S/3732/19/FL
Parish(es): Madingley
Proposal: First floor side extension
Site address: Belvoir Cottage, The Avenue, Madingley, CB23 8AD
Applicant(s): Mr and Mrs P Nunn
Recommendation: Approval
Key material considerations: Principle of development in the Green Belt;
Visual amenity;
Residential amenity.
Committee Site Visit: None
Departure Application: No
Presenting Officers: Richard Fitzjohn (Senior Planning Officer)
Charlotte Peet (Planning Officer)
Application brought to Committee because: Madingley Parish Council requests the application be determined by Planning Committee.
Date by which decision due: 14th February 2020.

Executive Summary

This application seeks householder planning permission for a first-floor side extension to a previously extended detached dwelling. The application site is located outside of the Madingley development framework and within the Green Belt.

The proposed extension would not increase the existing footprint of the dwelling, it would be modest in scale and it would be of a coherent design which is sympathetic to the character and appearance of the existing dwelling. Given its sympathetic design and its modest scale, form and height, it is considered that the proposed extension would not result in a disproportionate addition that would represent inappropriate development that is by definition harmful to the Green Belt in policy terms; nor would it result in a visually intrusive development that would harm the rural and open character and appearance of the Green Belt or the countryside.

Therefore, the proposal is in accordance with Policies S/4, NH/8, NH/9, HQ/1 and H/13 of the Local Plan 2018 and paragraph 145 of the NPPF.

Planning History

S/2417/19/LD - Certificate of lawful development for a proposed side and rear extension – Approved 30.08.2019

S/0907/19/LD - Certificate of lawful development for a proposed side extension – Approved 04.07.2019

S/0366/18/LD - Lawful Development Certificate for proposed single storey side extension – Approved 27.04.2018

S/1680/14/FL - Two storey rear extension following demolition of existing extension – Approved 06.10.2014

S/1331/04/F - Extension, Double Garage / Hobbies Room with Games Room Over and New Vehicular Access – Refused 24.08.2004

C/0111/55/ - Use of Part of House as Post Office – Approved 17.03.1955

C/0213/54/ - Erection of house or bungalow – Approved 27.05.1954

Planning Policies

National Planning Policy and Guidance
National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2019
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)

South Cambridgeshire Local Plan September 2018

S/4: Green Belt

S/7: Development Frameworks

HQ/1: Design Principles

NH/8: Mitigating the Impact of Development in and Adjoining the Green Belt

NH/9: Redevelopment of Previously Developed Sites and Infilling in the Green Belt

H/13: Extensions to Dwellings in the Countryside

South Cambridgeshire District Council Supplementary Planning Documents
District Design Guide SPD – Adopted March 2010

Consultation

Madingley Parish Council – Unanimously object to the application under the material consideration of layout and density.

Belvoir Cottage is situated just outside of Madingley conservation area and within the Green Belt; therefore it is subject to Green Belt Regulations. Within Green Belt, Policy NH/9 (1.b.) supports the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. In addition, Policy HQ1(1.d.) requires development to be compatible with its location and appropriate in terms of scale, density, mass etc.

Belvoir Cottage was originally built as a modest labourer's cottage in 1902. Planning permission was granted in 2014 to increase the capacity/density by 50%. 2 lawful development certificates have been granted in 2019 confirming a side extension and another side and rear extension were permitted development.

Believe the proposed extension is not in keeping with Policy NH/9(1) or policy HQ/1 (d) of the Local Plan.

Representations

Neighbours

Representations have been received in support of:

- The cohesive design to the dwelling and surrounding properties.
- Neighbour amenity

One representation has been received with objections regarding the disproportionate increase to the property, when considered with the previous enlargements.

Site and Surroundings

Belvoir Cottage, The Avenue is a two-storey, detached dwelling located outside the development framework of Madingley and in the countryside. The proposal site is located within the Green Belt.

Proposal

The proposal is for a first-floor side extension to the existing dwelling. The proposed extension would be 2.35 metres wide and 6 metres deep. It would be set back 3 metres from the front elevation of the dwelling and it would protrude 2.5 metres in height above an existing single-storey side extension. The proposed extension would be finished externally with painted render walls, slate roof and timber windows and doors.

Planning Assessment

Principle of development in the Green Belt

The proposal site is located within the Green Belt, outside the Madingley development framework and in the countryside.

Policy S/4 of Local Plan states that new development in the Green Belt will only be approved in accordance with Green Belt policy in the National Planning Policy Framework.

Paragraph 143 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances.

Paragraph 144 states that when considering any planning application, local planning authorities should ensure that substantial weight is given to any harm to the Green Belt. 'Very special circumstances' will not exist unless the potential harm to the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness, and any other harm resulting from the proposal, is clearly outweighed by other considerations.

Paragraph 145 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that a local planning authority should regard the construction of new buildings as inappropriate in the Green Belt, however exceptions to this include the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. This is reaffirmed within policy NH/9 of the Local Plan.

The proposal would result in a minor addition above the approved ground floor element, ref. S/0907/19/LD, dated 04 July 2019. It would extend 2.35 metres from the side wall of the dwelling and the ridge height would be lower than the existing dwelling.

Given the modest scale, form and height the proposed extension it would not be considered to result in a disproportionate addition that would represent inappropriate development that is by definition harmful to the Green Belt in policy terms. Therefore, the proposal is in accordance with Policies S/4 and NH/9 of the Local Plan 2018 and paragraph 145 of the NPPF.

Visual amenity

Policy NH/8 of the Local Plan states that any development proposals within the Green Belt must be located and designed so that they do not have an adverse effect on the rural character and openness of the Green Belt.

Given that proposed extension would not increase the existing footprint of the dwelling and would be modest in scale and taking into account the coherent design of the proposal, the proposed development is not considered to result in a visually intrusive development that would harm the rural and open character and appearance of the Green Belt.

Policy H/13 of the Local Plan states that any extensions to dwellings in the Countryside must not create a separate dwelling or be capable of separation from the existing dwelling, must be in scale and character with the existing dwelling and would not materially change its impact on its surroundings and must not result in a disproportionate addition to the original dwelling if in the Green Belt.

The proposed first floor, side extension would maintain the eaves height of the existing dwelling, would have a ridge height lower than the existing dwelling and would be set back from the principal elevation so that it would appear as a subservient addition that would be in scale with the existing dwelling. Given that the proposal would match the pitch of the existing roof, and appear similar in terms of the design, materials and fenestrations, it is considered in keeping with the existing dwelling house and is not considered to materially alter the impact on the countryside. The proposed development is not considered to be capable of separation.

The Parish Council and one neighbour raise concerns about cumulative increase to the dwelling, and the harm this may cause to the Green Belt. Whilst, officers note that the existing dwelling has been considerably extended in the past, especially under ref. S/1680/14/FL, dated 06 October 2014, the proposed extension would itself be very modest and would not result in an addition that would be disproportionate to the existing dwelling.

The Avenue is characterised by reasonably large, detached dwellings situated in spacious plots that are varied in form and design. The proposal would be visible from the street scene, however given the variety and size of the surrounding of dwellings in this section of The Avenue, it is not considered that the proposed extension would cause significant harm to the character and appearance of the local area.

Given the modest nature of the proposal a landscaping condition is not considered necessary in this circumstance. Therefore, it is considered to be in accordance with policies NH/8, NH/9, H/13 and HQ/1 of the Local Plan 2018.

Residential amenity

The proposal site would have three adjacent neighbours, Elm Cottage to the north, Arden House to the south and No. 4 Dry Drayton Road to the west.

The proposed extension would result in a first-floor addition, to the north of the existing dwelling. The proposed development would involve the installation of two windows, one on the front of the property and another to the rear.

Taking into account the existing views at first floor level and given that no new direct views would be created by the proposed rear window to Elm Cottage and Arden House, it is considered that the proposed extension would not result in a significant loss of privacy to the amenity of Elm Cottage nor Arden House. Whilst, the occupier of Elm Cottage has raised concerns over the rear window, and suggested it should be frosted, it is not considered necessary in this case due to the oblique angle of views between the window and Elm Cottage which prevents a significant loss of privacy.

No. 4 Dry Drayton Road would be subject to direct views from the additional window, however given the reasonable distance from the neighbouring property and taking into account that the proposed rear window would not serve a habitable room, the proposed extension would not be considered to cause loss of privacy to the amenity of No 4 Dry Drayton Road.

Given the modest scale of the proposal, and the distance from neighbouring properties, it is considered that the proposed development would not create a significant loss of light or overbearing impact to the residential amenity of the adjacent neighbouring dwellings.

Conclusion

Having regard to applicable national and local planning policies, and having taken all relevant material considerations into account, it is considered that planning permission should be granted in this instance.

Recommendation

Officers recommend that the Committee APPROVES the application, subject to the following recommended conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.
(Reason – To ensure that consideration of any future application for development in the area will not be prejudiced by permission for development, which have not been acted upon).
2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Location Plan of CB23 8AD, Proposed Site Plan, dwg no. PL-1-01 and Proposed Plans and Elevations, dwg no. PL-2-01.
(Reason – To facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990).

Report Authors:

Richard Fitzjohn
Charlotte Peet
Telephone Number:

Senior Planning Officer
Planning Officer
07704018426