

## **SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

Minutes of a meeting of the Planning Committee held on  
Wednesday, 13 November 2019 at 10.00 a.m.

PRESENT: Councillor John Batchelor – Chairman

Anna Bradnam  
Dr. Martin Cahn  
Dr. Claire Daunton (substitute)     Peter Fane  
Brian Milnes                             Judith Rippeth  
Deborah Roberts                         Peter Topping  
Heather Williams

Officers in attendance for all or part of the meeting:

Christopher Carter (Delivery Manager - Strategic Sites), Alistair Funge (Planning Enforcement Officer), Rory McKenna (Deputy Head of Legal Practice), Stephen Reid (Senior Planning Lawyer), Ian Senior (Democratic Services Officer) and Rebecca Ward (Principal Planning Officer)

### **1. APOLOGIES**

Councillors Pippa Heylings and Nick Wright sent Apologies for Absence. Councillor Claire Daunton substituted for Councillor Heylings.

In the absence of Councillor Pippa Heylings, the Committee agreed by affirmation than Councillor Brian Milnes be appointed Vice-Chairman of the meeting.

### **2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Councillor John Batchelor declared a Non-disclosable Pecuniary Interest in Minute 5 (S/2501/19/RM - Linton (Land to the North and South of Bartlow Road)). Councillor Batchelor's son, Councillor Henry Batchelor, had a business relationship with the developer. In view of the legal advice he had received, Councillor John Batchelor would withdraw to the public gallery, take no part in the debate, and would not vote. However, South Cambridgeshire District Council's Monitoring Officer had granted Councillor John Batchelor a dispensation allowing him to address the Committee as a local Member.

Councillor Deborah Roberts declared a non-pecuniary interest in Minute 7 (S/0913/19/VC - Fowlmere (Apple Acre Park)). As a member of Fowlmere Parish Council, Councillor Roberts had had some involvement with this application in the past but was considering the matter afresh.

Councillor Peter Topping declared a non-pecuniary interest in Minute 7 (S/0913/19/VC - Fowlmere (Apple Acre Park)). As the Cambridgeshire County Councillor representing Fowlmere, Councillor Topping had had some involvement with this application as a result of his attendance at meetings of Fowlmere Parish Council. He was familiar with the site and was considering the matter afresh.

### **3. RECORDED VOTING**

By affirmation, the Committee unanimously agreed that all substantive votes at the current Planning Committee meeting should be recorded by name and / or number and name.

#### 4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS SCHEDULED MEETING

The Committee authorised the Chairman to sign, as a correct record, the Minutes of the meeting held on 9 October 2019, subject to the following amendment:

##### **Minute 7 – Enforcement Report**

In the fifth paragraph, delete the word “Argus” and insert the word “Anglers”.

#### 5. S/2501/19/RM - LINTON (LAND TO THE NORTH AND SOUTH OF BARTLOW ROAD)

Members visited the site on 12 November 2019.

In accordance with his Declaration of Interest (Minute 2 refers) Councillor John Batchelor withdrew to the public gallery. Councillor Brian Milnes (Vice-Chairman of the meeting) took the chair and, by affirmation, the Committee agreed that Councillor Peter Fane be appointed Vice-Chairman for the duration of the current item.

The current application for Reserved Matters followed the Committee’s refusal of application S/2487/18/RM in May 2019.

Members had regard to the update report published on 7 November 2019 and, in particular, the updates to paragraphs 10 (comments from the Landscape Officer) and 15 (comments from the Affordable Housing Officer) of the main report published on 5 November 2019, and deletion of the reference to Plot 35 having a garage as part of the application. The case officer addressed Linton Parish Council’s concerns relating to procedure, including validation of the application and adequacy of public consultation. She said that, as a Reserved Matters application was not technically a planning application, officers felt that due process had been followed.

Councillor Enid Bald (Linton Parish Council) and Councillor John Batchelor (in his capacity as a local Member) addressed the meeting.

Members’ debate focussed on the ‘pepper-potting’ of the affordable housing, design, including building heights, and the nature of the public consultation. Councillor Deborah Roberts concluded that the revised layout of the affordable housing was probably the best that could be hoped for. However, she expressed disappointment that the developers had failed fully to address the Committee’s concerns, raised in May 2019, about design. Councillor Roberts said the Committee should defend its policies.

Taking a contrary view, Councillor Peter Fane said that significant changes had been made to the proposal, and that it should now be approved.

Councillor Brian Milnes considered the design in the context of the huge variety of housing in Linton. He concluded that it would be difficult to justify refusal on the ground of the proposal being contrary to the character of the local area.

By five votes to four, the Planning Committee **approved** the application subject to the Conditions and Informative set out in the main report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development, with the final wording of any amendments to these being delegated to officers in consultation with the Chairman and Vice-Chairman for this item (Councillors Brian Milnes and Peter Fane) prior to the issuing of the Decision Notice.

(Councillors Cahn, Daunton, Fane, Milnes and Rippeth voted to approve the application. Councillors Bradnam, Roberts, Topping and Heather Williams voted to refuse it)

**6. S/4298/18/FL - WILLINGHAM (74 RAMPTON ROAD)**

Members noted that this application had been **withdrawn** from the agenda.

**7. S/0913/19/VC - FOWLMERE (APPLE ACRE PARK)**

Members visited the site on 12 November 2019.

Members noted that the applicant had appealed against the non-determination of this application and that, therefore, South Cambridgeshire District Council was no longer the determining Authority. They also noted the site history and the issue of a Certificate of Lawful Use, and clarified several issues underlying the application and appeal.

South Cambridgeshire District Council had received a letter from Stephens Scown LLP regarding the content of the report and, specifically, some comments within it relating to a site in East Hertfordshire. Officers confirmed that these comments had been made by a third party and were not relevant to the consideration of this application. The Council understood that the owners of the Apple Acre site had no ownership interest in any site in East Hertfordshire. Members noted that the related representation had been removed from the South Cambridgeshire District Council website.

Councillor Peter Burge (Fowlmere Parish Council) and Councillor Deborah Roberts (speaking as the local Member) addressed the meeting.

Following some debate, Councillor Deborah Roberts proposed that further consideration be deferred. The proposal was seconded by Councillor Heather Williams and, upon a vote being taken, the motion was defeated by eight votes to two. Councillors Roberts and Heather Williams voted for deferral. Councillors John Batchelor, Bradnam, Cahn, Daunton, Fane, Milnes, Rippeth and Topping voted against.

Moving directly to the substantive recommendation, the Planning Committee unanimously **endorsed** the officers' proposed positions at Appeal in respect of Areas A and D, as set out in paragraphs 103 to 116 inclusive of the report from the Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development.

**8. ENFORCEMENT REPORT**

The Committee **received and noted** an Update on enforcement action.

In response to Members' questions, the Principal Enforcement Officer said that:

- negotiations were ongoing in respect of Anglers Way, Waterbeach
- Smithy Fen, Cottenham was well in hand
- The former Barclays Bank building in Great Shelford was being dealt with
- The issues in Great Wilbraham had been resolved

**9. APPEALS AGAINST PLANNING DECISIONS AND ENFORCEMENT ACTION**

The Committee **received and noted** a report on appeals against planning decisions and enforcement action.

---

**The Meeting ended at 12.25 p.m.**

---