

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Planning Committee

20 May 2020

AUTHOR/S: Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development

Application Number: S/3732/19/FL

Parish(es): Madingley

Proposal: Two storey side extension

Site address: Belvoir Cottage, The Avenue, Madingley, CB23 8AD

Applicant(s): Mr and Mrs P Nunn

Recommendation: Approval

Key material considerations: Principle of development in the Green Belt;
Visual amenity;
Residential amenity.

Committee Site Visit: None

Departure Application: No

Presenting Officer: Richard Fitzjohn (Senior Planning Officer)

Application brought to Committee because: Madingley Parish Council requests the application be determined by Planning Committee.

Date by which decision due: 10 April 2020

1.0 Executive Summary

- 1.1 This application seeks householder planning permission for a two-storey side extension to a previously extended detached dwelling. The application site is located outside of the Madingley development framework and within the Green Belt.
- 1.2 Given the proportionate scale, subservience and sympathetic design of the proposed extension in relation to the original dwelling, with consideration also given to the previously constructed two-storey rear extension, it is considered that the proposed extension would not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building, in accordance with policy NH/9 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 and Paragraph 145 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).
- 1.3 Due to the location of the application site between other dwellings within a developed row of residential built form, and with residential built form directly to the rear of the site, it is considered that the proposed extension would not have an

adverse effect on the rural character and openness of the Green Belt, in accordance with policy NH/8 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

- 1.4 It is considered that the proposed extension would be compatible with its location and appropriate in terms of scale, density, mass, form, siting, design, proportion, materials, texture and colour in relation to the surrounding area, in accordance with Policy HQ/1 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.
- 1.5 It is considered that the proposal accords with Policies S/4, NH/8, NH/9, HQ/1 and H/13 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 and paragraph 145 of the NPPF.

2.0 Planning History

- 2.1 S/2417/19/LD – Certificate of lawful development for a proposed side and rear extension – Approved 30.08.2019
- 2.2 S/0907/19/LD – Certificate of lawful development for a proposed side extension – Approved 04.07.2019
- 2.3 S/0366/18/LD – Lawful Development Certificate for proposed single storey side extension – Approved 27.04.2018
- 2.4 S/1680/14/FL – Two storey rear extension following demolition of existing extension – Approved 06.10.2014
- 2.5 S/1331/04/F – Extension, Double Garage / Hobbies Room with Games Room Over and New Vehicular Access – Refused 24.08.2004
- 2.6 C/0111/55/ - Use of Part of House as Post Office – Approved 17.03.1955
- 2.7 C/0213/54/ - Erection of house or bungalow – Approved 27.05.1954

3.0 Planning Policies

3.1 National Planning Policy and Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2019
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)

3.2 South Cambridgeshire Local Plan September 2018

S/4: Green Belt
S/7: Development Frameworks
HQ/1: Design Principles
NH/8: Mitigating the Impact of Development in and Adjoining the Green Belt
NH/9: Redevelopment of Previously Developed Sites and Infilling in the Green Belt
H/13: Extensions to Dwellings in the Countryside

3.3 South Cambridgeshire District Council Supplementary Planning Documents

District Design Guide SPD – Adopted March 2010
Sustainable Design and Construction SPD - adopted January 2020

4.0 Consultations

- 4.1 Madingley Parish Council – Unanimously object to the application under the material consideration of layout and density.

Belvoir Cottage is situated just outside of Madingley conservation area and within the Green Belt; therefore it is subject to Green Belt regulations. Within Green Belt, Policy NH/9 (1.b.) supports the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. In addition, Policy HQ1(1.d.) requires development to be compatible with its location and appropriate in terms of scale, density, mass etc.

Belvoir Cottage was originally built as a modest labourer's cottage in 1902. Planning permission was granted in 2014 to increase the capacity/density by 50%. 2 lawful development certificates have been granted in 2019 confirming a side extension and another side and rear extension were permitted development.

Believe the proposed extension is not in keeping with Policy NH/9(1) or policy HQ/1 (d) of the Local Plan.

5.0 Representations

5.1 Representations have been received from 3 neighbouring properties – 2 in support and 1 raising an objection.

5.2 Representations have been received from 2 nearby properties in support of the application.

5.3 Avenue House, High Street, Madingley – Supports the application

- The proposed development seems to have little impact on the neighbours.
- Thoughtful and sympathetic design by the architect to ensure the property blends in with the surrounding properties and setting using appropriate materials to achieve this.
- The development enhances the property which at present looks disproportional to the size of plot, especially when compared to the other larger dwellings on The Avenue.
- Arden House - The plot that this property was built on was once a garden with a woodland area and has since had permission granted for a detached dwelling which is extremely large to the size of plot and is also in the green belt.
- High Croft - In 2015 permission was granted for the building of this property within the Green Belt and over time has been developed to approximately 70% larger than the development rights.
- This much smaller proposal to Belvoir Cottage, therefore, would comfortably blend in to the surrounding street scape with no problems.
- Queries the reasons for the level of interest in the application by the Parish Council, when they have not commented on larger applications within the village.
- Hopes planning permission is granted for this application which is clearly a family trying to thoughtfully and sympathetically enhance their dwelling for better living conditions.

5.4 Elm Cottage, The Avenue, Madingley

- Has discussed window arrangements with the applicant.
- Fully supports the application. Respects what the applicants want to achieve for their family home.

5.5 Arden House, Dry Drayton Road, Madingley – Objects to the application

- The application proposes a disproportionate increase in the size of a Cambridge Green Belt property that has already been extended significantly in recent years.
- In 2014, the modest cottage, built in 1902, was expanded by 50%.
- 3 further applications have been made:- 2 of these have fallen under permitted development and the 3rd is the current proposal for a two- storey extension.
- The sum total of these proposed developments, which now fill virtually the entire width of the site, is incompatible with the criteria defined in the Local Plan.
- Raises concerns to the above applications being submitted in three stages and that further applications of a more radical nature could follow.

6.0 **Site and Surroundings**

6.1 Belvoir Cottage, The Avenue is a two-storey, detached dwelling located outside the development framework of Madingley and in the countryside. The proposal site is located within the Green Belt.

7.0 **Proposal**

7.1 The proposal is for a two-storey side extension to the existing dwelling. The proposed extension would be finished externally with painted render walls, slate roof and timber windows and doors.

8.0 **Planning Assessment**

8.1 The key considerations are the principle of development in the Green Belt, the character and appearance of the area and countryside, and residential amenity.

9.0 Principle of development in the Green Belt

9.1 The proposal site is located within the Green Belt, outside the Madingley development framework and within the countryside.

9.2 Policy S/4 of Local Plan states that new development in the Green Belt will only be approved in accordance with Green Belt policy in the National Planning Policy Framework.

9.3 Paragraph 143 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that inappropriate development is, by definition, harmful to the Green Belt and should not be approved except in very special circumstances.

9.4 Paragraph 144 states that when considering any planning application, local planning authorities should ensure that substantial weight is given to any harm to the Green Belt. 'Very special circumstances' will not exist unless the potential harm to the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness, and any other harm resulting from the proposal, is clearly outweighed by other considerations.

9.5 Paragraph 145 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2019 states that a local planning authority should regard the construction of new buildings as inappropriate in the Green Belt, however exceptions to this include the extension or alteration of a building provided that it does not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. This is reaffirmed within policy NH/9 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

- 9.6 Policy NH/8 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 states that any development proposals within the Green Belt must be located and designed so that they do not have an adverse effect on the rural character and openness of the Green Belt.
- 9.7 The Parish Council and one neighbouring occupier has raised concerns about cumulative increase to the dwelling and the harm this may cause to the Green Belt.
- 9.8 The proposed extension would be proportionate in scale, subservient and of a design which is sympathetic to the original dwelling. With consideration also given to the previously constructed two-storey rear extension, which is largely screened from view from the public highway by the original part of the dwelling, it is considered that the proposed extension would not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building. It should also be noted that the proposed extension requires the demolition of an existing garage to facilitate it, which would help to mitigate the impacts of the additional built form created by the proposed extension. It is therefore considered that the proposed extension would not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building would in accordance with policy NH/9 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 and Paragraph 145 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).
- 9.9 Due to the location of the application site between other dwellings within a developed row of residential built form, and with residential built form directly to the rear of the site, it is considered that the proposed extension would not have an adverse effect on the rural character and openness of the Green Belt, in accordance with policy NH/8 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.
- 9.10 For the reasons set out above, it is considered that the proposal would not result in disproportionate additions over and above the size of the original building, and therefore would not represent inappropriate development that is by definition harmful to the Green Belt. As such, the proposal is in accordance with Policies S/4, NH/8 and NH/9 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 and paragraph 145 of the NPPF.
- 9.11 It should be noted that, in addition to the two-storey rear extension which was erected following approval of planning permission S/1680/14/FL, there have been a 3 separate Lawful Development Certificates granted on the site for proposed single-storey extensions to both sides of the dwelling. The planning history relating to these applications is summarised within the Planning History section of this report. The granting of those Lawful Development Certificates provided confirmation from the Local Planning Authority that the single-storey extensions proposed by those applications were permitted development and did not require the benefit of planning permission. It should be noted that none of those proposed single-storey extensions have, at present, been implemented. Furthermore, as they are permitted development but have not been implemented, they should not be considered when assessing the current application for planning permission.

10.0 Character and appearance of the area and countryside

- 10.1 The Avenue is characterised by reasonably large, detached dwellings situated in spacious plots that are varied in form and design. The proposed extension would

be visible from the public highway along The Avenue, however given the variety and size of the surrounding of dwellings in this section of The Avenue, it is not considered that the proposed extension would cause significant harm to the character and appearance of the local area.

- 10.2 Policy H/13 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018 states that extensions to dwellings outside village framework boundaries will be permitted where:
- a. The development would not create a separate dwelling or be capable of separation from the existing dwelling;
 - b. The extension is in scale and character with the existing dwelling and would not materially change its impact on its surroundings;
 - c. The existing home is of permanent design and construction;
 - d. If in the Green Belt that the extension would not result in a disproportionate addition to the original dwelling;
 - e. If the original dwelling is subject to an occupancy condition, it must be demonstrated that the resultant dwelling can be supported by the viability of the site/holding or rural enterprise and that the cost of its occupation would not be unaffordable to workers employed in agriculture, forestry or another business where a rural location is essential.
- 10.3 The proposed two-storey extension would maintain the eaves height of the existing dwelling, would have a ridge height lower than the existing dwelling and would be set back from the principal elevation so that it would appear as a subservient addition that would be in scale with the existing dwelling. Given that the proposed extension would match the pitch of the existing roof, and appear similar in terms of the design, materials and fenestrations, it is considered in keeping with the character of the existing dwelling. For these reasons, it is considered that the proposed extension would not materially change the impact of the existing dwelling on its surroundings. The proposed development is not considered to be capable of separation and the Green Belt considerations have already been addressed within this report. It is therefore considered that the proposed development accords with policies H/13, NH/8 and NH/9 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018. Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed extension would be compatible with its location and appropriate in terms of scale, density, mass, form, siting, design, proportion, materials, texture and colour in relation to the surrounding area, in accordance with Policy HQ/1 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

11.0 Residential amenity

- 11.1 The application site has three adjacent neighbours, Elm Cottage to the north, Arden House to the south and No. 4 Dry Drayton Road to the west.
- 11.2 The proposal is for a two-storey extension to the north of the existing dwelling. The proposed extension includes two first-floor windows, one within the front elevation and one within the rear elevation. The proposed extension also includes a number of ground-floor windows, which would not cause any significant overlooking of neighbouring properties due to their low height.
- 11.3 Taking into account the existing views at first floor level and given that no new direct views would be created by the proposed rear window to Elm Cottage and Arden House, it is considered that the proposed extension would not result in a significant loss of privacy to the amenity of Elm Cottage nor Arden House.
- 11.4 The first-floor en-suite window within the rear elevation of the proposed extension

would face directly towards No. 4 Dry Drayton Road. However, this window would serve a non-habitable room and would be sufficiently distanced from No. 4 Dry Drayton Road to prevent causing a significant loss of privacy to the amenity of this neighbouring property.

11.5 Given the siting, scale and reasonable separation distance of the proposed extension from the neighbouring properties, it is considered that the proposed development would not create a significant loss of light or overbearing impact to the residential amenity of the adjacent neighbouring dwellings.

11.6 It is therefore considered that the proposed development would not create any significant detrimental impacts upon the residential amenity of the neighbouring properties, in accordance with policy HQ/1 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

12.0 Conclusion

12.1 Having regard to applicable national and local planning policies, and having taken all relevant material considerations into account, it is considered that planning permission should be granted in this instance.

13.0 Recommendation

13.1 Officers recommend that the Committee APPROVES the application, subject to the following recommended conditions:

1. The development hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission.
(Reason – To ensure that consideration of any future application for development in the area will not be prejudiced by permission for development, which have not been acted upon).
2. The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: Location Plan of CB23 8AD, PL-1-01 Rev A and PL-2-01 Rev A.
(Reason – To facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 73 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990).

14.0 Background Papers:

14.1 The following list contains links to the documents on the Council's website and / or an indication as to where hard copies can be inspected.

- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018
- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD's)
- Planning File Ref: S/3732/19/FL

Report Authors:

Richard Fitzjohn
Charlotte Peet
Telephone Number:

Senior Planning Officer
Planning Officer
07704018426