

SOUTH CAMBRIDGESHIRE DISTRICT COUNCIL

REPORT TO: Development and Conservation Control Committee 1st December 2004
AUTHOR/S: Director of Development Services

S/2113/04/F - Willingham Extension at 145 Station Road, for J Anderson

Recommendation: Refusal

Site and Proposal

1. The property is a two-storey detached house situated on the eastern side of Station Road. To the northern side of the property lies a driveway, with gated access set back from the highway.
2. The application, registered on the 15th October 2004, proposes to erect a two-storey rear extension under a pitched roof. The proposed structure would project 6.675 metres back from an existing extension and would measure 6.26 metres wide. It would also measure 7.2 metres in height (5.2 metres to eaves level). The proposal would provide a lounge with ensuite bedroom above.

Planning History

3. **S/2240/03/F** - Application for the creation of 2 wildlife ponds at no.145 Station Road, approved on the 15th January 2004.
4. **S/1909/03/F** - Application for the erection of a detached garage at no.145 Station Road, approved on the 7th October 2003.
5. **S/0742/03/F** - This application for a two-storey rear extension at no.145 Station Road, was approved on the 13th May 2003 after amendments to the scheme were received on the 12th May 2003 that reduced the scale of the proposal. The permission represents a 59% increase in the floor area of the dwelling.
6. **S/0591/02/F** - This application for a two-storey rear extension, at no.158 Station Road, was refused on the 14th May 2002 on the grounds of an excessive increase in floorspace from the original dwelling and visual prominence in a countryside location. The decision to refuse this application was upheld at appeal (appeal ref: APP/W0350/A/02/1095179), decision dated on the 8th January 2003.
7. **S/1462/04/F** - This application amended an earlier application (**S/0664/04/F**) to extend and convert the roofs of the bungalows at 153 and 155 Station Road and to alter the garages at these addresses to provide pitched roofs. It was approved on the 1st September 2004 and represents a 12% increase in the volume of the dwellings. The earlier application represented a 9% increase in the volume of the dwellings.

Planning Policy

8. The site is located within the countryside, outside of the village development framework defined in the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004.

9. Local Plan 2004 **Policy HG13** states that extensions to dwellings in the countryside (i.e. outside of village frameworks defined in this Plan) will be permitted where: 1) the proposed development would not create a separate dwelling or be capable of separation from the existing dwelling; 2) the extension does not exceed the height of the original dwelling; 3) the extension does not lead to a 50% increase or more in volume or gross internal floor area of the original dwelling; 4) the proposed extension is in scale and character with the existing dwelling and would not materially change the impact of the dwelling on its surroundings; 5) the proposed extension has regard to the criteria in **Policy HG12** of this Plan.
10. Local Plan 2004 **Policy HG12** is concerned with extensions and alterations to dwellings within frameworks and refers to the use of appropriate design and materials; impact on neighbouring amenities; the loss of parking spaces; unacceptable visual impact on the street scene; and boundary treatment.
11. Structure Plan 2003 **Policy P1/2** states that development in the countryside will be restricted unless the proposals can be demonstrated to be essential in a particular rural location.

Consultation

12. **Willingham Parish Council** recommends approval

Representations

13. None

Planning Comments - Key Issues

14. The key issues in relation to this application are:
 - The increase in volume of the dwelling from the original.
 - The scale and character of the proposed development in context with the original dwelling and the resultant impact on the countryside.
15. The site lies within the countryside. **Policy HG13** of the Local Plan requires extensions to dwellings in the countryside to not lead to a 50% increase or more in volume or gross internal floor area of the original dwelling. The policy looks to restrict the size of proposed extensions to dwellings in the countryside to carefully protect the character of rural locations and also to prevent the reduction in the stock of smaller and medium sized dwellings in countryside areas. This application proposes a two-storey rear extension which, when considered alongside the existing extensions that would remain, would lead to a significant increase in the volume of the dwelling by approximately 145% from the original dwelling. In terms of floorspace, the proposal would result in an increase of 85.8% from the original. This would be in direct conflict with the terms of the above policy, exceeding the policy allowance for volume increases by 95%, and for floorspace increase by approximately 36%.
16. **Policy HG13** of the Local Plan also states that extension to dwellings in the countryside should be in scale and character with the existing dwelling and not lead to a material change in the impact of the dwelling on its surroundings. The proposed extension would be sited at the rear of the dwelling, featuring a two storey range that would extend 6.675 metres back from rear wall of existing two storey extension. In

total this would lead to a two-storey range at the rear of this property that would measure 10.3 metres deep. From the south views of a large two storey range to the rear of the property would be clearly visible, and would lead to an unacceptable change in the scale and character of the dwelling.

17. When considering this proposal it is also important to consider the context to which the site relates. In 2003 an approval was issued on the site (ref **S/0742/03/F**) for a smaller two-storey extension, following an amendment to reduce the scheme. The initial proposal amounted to a 68% increase in floor area that the Authority felt was in excess of what would be acceptable on the site, given its location in the countryside and the context of **Policy HG13**. The revised proposal represented a significant reduction in floor area to 59% from original. Given the resultant reduction in volume and floorspace, combined with the lesser visual impact of the proposal, the Authority deemed that no significant harm was caused to the character of the existing dwelling or surrounding to countryside to warrant a refusal.
18. In July 2004 an application was approved for roof extensions to the dwellings at 153 and 155 Station Road (ref: **S/1462/04/F**). This application was for an amended design to the extensions to the properties given consent under reference **S/0664/04/F**. These two dwellings are also sited outside of the village framework. However, the form of these properties and the subsequent extensions approved vary significantly from the application under consideration. Unlike 145 Station Road the two properties at 153 and 155 were originally two bungalows. They are sited between two 2-storey dwellings and the approved extensions led to an increase of 12% in volume from the original dwellings. Given the differences between the character of the two sites and the extent of the extensions on this site and the application site, the two are not comparable.
19. In comparison, in 2002 an application similar to that under consideration was refused for extensions to 158 Station Road (ref **S/0591/02/F**). This proposal sought a number of extensions to this property in the countryside, the majority of which were contained within a 10.2 metre deep two storey rear extension. This proposal would have led to an increase in floorspace of 114% from the original dwelling. It is important to consider that the application was refused on the grounds of excessive increase in floorspace, visual prominence in the countryside and material change in the impact of the property on its surroundings. This decision was upheld at appeal (ref: **APP/W0530/A/02/1095179**).

Recommendation

Refusal

No.145 Station Road is a detached dwelling sited in a loose ribbon of development outside the defined village framework for Willingham.

The proposed extensions would, when combined with existing additions to the original property, result in the volume of the original property being increased by approximately 145%. This extra volume would be comprised within the proposed 6.675 metre deep two storey extension, combined with the existing 3.62 metre deep two storey extension to the rear of the property. The resultant combined extensions would be approximately 10.3 metres deep and would be out of keeping with the character and scale of the original dwelling. The proposed extension would also be a visually prominent feature in the countryside, particularly when viewed from the south, and the proposal would therefore contravene **Policy HG13** of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004 which requires extensions to dwellings in the

countryside to be in scale and character with the existing dwelling, and to not lead to an increase of 50% or more in volume or gross internal floor area of the original dwelling.

Background Papers: the following background papers were used in the preparation of this report:

Cambridgeshire and Peterborough Structure Plan 2003;
South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2004;
Planning Files Refs: S/1462/04/F, S/0664/04/F, S/2240/03/F, S/1909/03/F, S/0742/03/F,
S/0591/02/F and S/2113/04/F.

Contact Officer: Michael Osbourn - Assistant Planning Officer
Telephone: (01954) 713379